

**Minutes of the Operational Review Committee  
Meeting Held  
Tuesday, February 21, 2017**

**Present:**

Councillor Maroosis, Committee Chair  
Councillor Anthony, Committee Member  
Councillor King, Committee Member  
Councillor Bain, Committee Member (5:10 p.m. to 6:15 p.m.)  
Councillor Serran, Committee Member  
Mayor McDonald, Committee Member (4:52 p.m. to 5:10 p.m. and 5:51 p.m. to 6:15 p.m.)  
Councillor Forgette  
Councillor Mayne (5:45 p.m. to 6:15 p.m.)  
Keith Robicheau, Chief Administrative Officer  
David Euler, Managing Director Engineering, Environmental and Works  
Domenic Schiavone, Director of Public Works  
Scott Franks, Roads and Traffic Manger

**Regrets:**

Brian Phillips, President CUPE Local 122  
Gord Mulcahey, Executive Member North Bay Professional Firefighters' Association  
Lea Janisse, Managing Director of Corporate Services  
John Severino, Managing Director Community Services  
Margaret Karpenko, Chief Financial Officer  
Jason Whiteley, Fire Chief

Special Review Committee Chair, George Maroosis, called the meeting to order at 4:52 p.m.

1. Adoption of Minutes:  
The Minutes of February 7, 2017 were approved as amended noting the next meeting as February 21, 2017 and will be presented to Council on March 7, 2017.
2. Business Arising from Minutes:
  - i. None
3. Operational Review of the Traffic Department.
  - Scott Franks and Domenic Schiavone were present in relation to the Roads Department Operation review. Copies of the presentation were provided to the Committee.
    - Minimum Maintenance Standards (MMS) are provincially mandated standards for all Ontario Municipalities. The MMS classify a roadway on a scale from 1 to 6. Guidelines for each of the classified roads are provided regarding tasks such as winter control, patrolling, potholes, shoulder drop offs, surface cracks/surface discontinuities, sidewalk discontinuities, bridge deck spalls, and street lighting.
    - The City of North Bay does not have any class 1 roads for which we are responsible to maintain.
    - We provide maintenance on Highway 63 up to Lee's Road. We also maintain Pinewood Park Drive up to Callander.
      - The road behind Northgate Square, Kingsway Avenue, was placed there as part of the trail. Is it a trail or a sidewalk?
        - ❖ It is a trail. We are unable to maintain it. We will review the location of a trail and if it is close to a sidewalk we may be able to coordinate maintenance with the sidewalk maintenance crew.
      - What is our standard of care? Are we low minimum?
        - ❖ Unlike with water requirements, there are no checks and balances with road maintenance. We often defend

complaints and claims from residents quite well and consider this an auditing tool for us. We will exceed the standards for road and snow maintenance. For every class of road you have so many hours to respond to and address concerns. Our standard is very black and white.

- If the minimum standard could be reduced, are we in a position to save money? Would that be hard to calculate?
  - ❖ We would have to balance legal and financial liability. Some areas are grey. I.e. Snow bank removal. In a Cul-de-sac the standard is lower.
- This is for snow removal. What is the standard for road surfacing? For example, the lowest class street?
  - ❖ This will be reviewed later in the presentation.
- We have 21 kilometers of unpaved roads (10.5 kilometers of road). Does it make sense to have a grader in Public Works?
  - ❖ We only have one Grader. We need it for ditching and shouldering work. We have already reduced the number of graders from 2 to 1.
- Is the Grader being used for snow removal?
  - ❖ Yes. It is used in ice removal and for washed out roads.
- When Water and Sewer employees go to the Roads Department is the employee's salary billed to that department?
  - ❖ The wages for that day come out of the Roads department and are coded to the appropriate cost center.
- Why is the Parks Department separate from Public Works and Roads? Does it make sense for them to be separate? Why do we separate outside staff?
  - ❖ Early in the Operation Review we discussed looking into the grouping of staff. We are reviewing this and looking at a shared individual between departments. What this looks like in detail is still not known.
- What is the difference between a Supervisor and a Charge hand?
  - ❖ A Chargehand is a lead unionized worker. They are a working staff member. The City is divided into 5 zones. Charge hands take the pressure off of Supervisors.
- We have to record patrols to prove the MMS? How are the patrols recorded?
  - ❖ Yes, we are required to record patrols to prove that we have met the requirements of the MMS. Until recently the patrols were recorded manually on paper. In the last two weeks we have moved to an electronic reporting process.
- If we have a record of plowing does that cover off the recorded patrols?
  - ❖ Patrolling and plowing are considered two separate tasks. Patrolling requirements vary according to the road classification of 1-6. Leadhands and Chargehands are completing the patrols.
- Are all trucks equipped with sand and salt?
  - ❖ No. Trucks can only run one material at a time. We do have liquid brine that we can run in conjunction. This material helps the sand or salt to stick and melt the ice on the road. The use of salt was eliminated from non-arterial roads.
- The big plows that the City has, do they run sand or salt.
  - ❖ The plows will run sand. A small amount of sand/salt is pre-mixed by weight with a 70% salt content.
- Do you have a wish list of equipment you would like?
  - ❖ We have completed a lot of demos of vehicles and eliminated single use vehicle to move to more functional year-round use equipment. We are constantly reviewing

and looking at equipment that would increase efficiencies.

- Those 14 units are they all double axle? Now that you moved to a single axle are you still able to get into some of these cul-de-sacs.
  - ❖ Yes. We are able to complete the plowing in the cul-de-sacs.
- Does it make sense to use single axle?
  - ❖ There are differing opinions on this however we prefer tandems.
- Which of these trucks can drop the brine?
  - ❖ There are 14 combination plows and 1 sander.
- Are we using calcium chloride?
  - ❖ Yes. We have been using it for about a month. Calcium chloride is used with sodium chloride and is good to -23° Celsius.
- With this group of equipment if we have a snow event of 10-15 centimeters how much of the equipment is used?
  - ❖ We will use all of it. We have a part time staffing pool to help with staffing the clean-up of a big snow event.
- Are you using the part-time pool if you have to address an event?
  - ❖ We will use our existing staff but will use part time staff as well as needed.
- In snow events some of the transit stops are unplowed. How do we handle that?
  - ❖ The bus stops located adjacent to a sidewalk are maintained. In some scenarios we do put the wing down to maintain more stops. We are currently looking at a private contractor to look after these areas. If we have insufficient resources we are creating a liability if clean some but not them all.
- Is it possible to say it is a 3 season stop? Is it possible to use an alternative location as a stop?
  - ❖ Discussions are underway to see what possible solutions are available.
- Could you provide an example of what streets are classified as?
  - ❖ Class 1 - Highway 11. Class 2 – Algonquin Avenue, Fisher Street, Cassells Street. Class 3 – Lansdowne Avenue. Class 4 – Oakwood Avenue. Class 5 – Brooke Street.
  - ❖ The bulk of residential streets are in Class 5.
- Concerns have been expressed that we are plowing roads too much.
  - ❖ On occasion plow operators will drop the plow on traffic corridors like Trout Lake Road when on route to the Public Works yard.
- The depths of the banks are quite high. What is the rationale about not plowing in further?
  - ❖ With the equipment we have it becomes difficult to maintain the widths of the roads.
- Which monitoring location do you use?
  - ❖ We have a variety of information sources to determine the events to defend claims. Staff patrols, feedback from the public and follow-up by staff in addition to monitoring for weather events and more all assist to ensure that we provide the best monitoring available.

4. Action Items:

- i. Review moving the Parks Department outside workers to the Public Works Department.
- ii. Review the numbers of Transit Stops that are 3 season and look at the potential of relocating stops to a better location.

Next Meeting: Tuesday, March 7, 2017– 4:45 p.m.

Agenda Item: Engineering, Environmental Services and Works Unit Review - David Euler

Meeting adjourned at 6:15 p.m.

---

Councillor George Maroosis  
Chair Operational Review Committee

---

Judy Bechard  
Deputy City Clerk